Engaging the non-state sector in early childhood education delivery:

An opportunity to reach the most disadvantaged children

Julie Bélanger, Laura Moscoviz and Signe Sorensen

 RECE Conference, Copenhagen
 September 2018
While there has been significant progress on ECE the sub-Saharan African region is lagging behind

1. Providers: Private institutions account for about two-thirds of total enrolment in SSA – who are they?

2. Access: Enrolment is at 18% on average – what are the access and equity issues?

3. Quality: Research indicates substantial gains in learning outcomes – what are the structural and process quality indicators?

Source: UNESCO Institute for Statistics Database.
EPG has undertaken primary research to investigate the composition of pre-primary education providers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Uganda</th>
<th>Côte d’Ivoire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Objectives</strong></td>
<td>(i) Improve evidence base on scope, strengths and weaknesses of ECE sector; (ii) Inform the design of a DFID project</td>
<td>(i) Improve evidence base on the quality of ECE; (ii) Inform a PPP pilot for the Ministry of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Providers</strong></td>
<td>Pre-primary schools (public, private for profit, private not for profit), community centres and home based centres (0-6 years)</td>
<td>Pre-primary schools (public and private – secular and confessional), informal schools (community centres) (3-6 year olds)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Region selection</strong></td>
<td>Northern Uganda (refugee settlements, mix of urban and rural settings)</td>
<td>Abidjan and Bouake (urban and peri urban settings)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Survey methodology</strong></td>
<td>Mapping: 218 pre-primary centres Sample: 114 pre-primary centres</td>
<td>Mapping: 492 pre-primary centres Sample: 165 pre-primary centres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Survey tools</strong></td>
<td>School leader, teacher, centre and lesson observation, parent focus groups</td>
<td>As in Uganda + inspectors and direct child evaluation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These studies were not designed for comparative analysis and were driven by Government needs.
Key findings from Uganda
Two-thirds of pre-primary providers are private

Surveyed pre-schools are located in:
- Adjumani
- Gulu
- Nebbi
- Zombo
Private fP have low fees, but do not serve the most disadvantaged
Official enrolment vs class sizes - hidden capacity?

Child to Teacher Ratio across centre operator type

- Community: 50
- Private not for profit: 24
- Private for profit: 23
- Public: 47

Average number of children per teacher

Significantly lower CT ratio in PnP and PFP compared to Community centres
Significantly larger CT ratio in Public compared to PnP

The difference between class size, attendance, and enrolment is statistically significantly different from zero
Dimensions of pre-primary education quality

**Structural Quality**: Regulatable aspects of a program that are assumed to promote the likelihood that classrooms will be of high quality

- Distal indicators of quality that refer to infrastructure (OECD, 2018)

For example: Teacher-child ratios, class size, qualifications and compensation of teachers and staff

**Process Quality**: Children’s direct experiences and interactions with teachers and with the instructional content within classrooms, “the engine of development" (social emotional, physical instructional)

- Proximal processes of children’s everyday experiences (OECD, 2018)

For example: Teacher-child interactions, health and safety provision
Pre-primary qualifications are associated with teaching quality but a minority of teachers are qualified.

- Between 30 and 70% of teachers did not receive pre-primary qualifications.
- This is worrisome as we find a strong relationship between having pre-primary qualification and the observed quality of teaching.
Adequate resources are associated with teaching quality but are lacking in the classroom

- Between 50 and 80% of teachers lack adequate resources in the classroom.
  - PfP teachers are most likely to report adequate resources.
- This is important as adequate resources is associated with better teaching practices, and learning stimulation.

### Adequate resources across providers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Provider</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private not for profit</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private for profit</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key findings from Côte d’Ivoire
The main ECE providers are private secular schools and public schools

- Informal schools are mostly represented in peri-urban settings where they make for more than a quarter of the pre-primary education providers.
ECE enrolment could increase within the structures currently available

- Capacity utilisation ratios are generally moderate, but higher in the public sector (78% vs 62% to 70% in non-state sector)

Only 1 out of 5 preschools are at full capacity or above in the public sector

- In terms of equity:
  - No gender gap observed.
  - Very few schools are adapted to children with special educational needs.
The cost of schooling is a major deterrent to enrolment in pre-primary school

- The cost of public schooling to parents is low relative to the private sector, though there is considerable variation within types of private providers.

- Although public education is free, parents still support costs related to material, security and maintenance (16,000 CFA francs per year per child ~ 28 USD)

- The cost to parents with children in private schools is approximately 4 times as high. Among formal private providers, the yearly cost of schooling to parents is 62,000 CFA francs on average (~ 111 USD) for confessional institutions and 68,000 CFA francs (~ 120 USD) for secular schools.

Across all types of providers, the fees paid by the parents are a main source of funding
While most public teachers have a professional diploma, this is rarely ECE specific.

- Teachers in the private sector are often unqualified but nearly half have received ECE specific training.
- Private schools fare better on pre-service specialised ECE training (31% to 44% of all teachers are trained).
The school and classroom environment is generally conducive to safe, play-based learning – but less so among informal providers.

- **School environment**: Slightly better in public and formal private schools than in informal schools.

- **Class room environment**: The classroom set-up is generally aligned with play-based learning, except among informal providers.
Teachers in formal private schools are more likely to adopt child-centred approaches to learning

• Especially among confessional providers, teachers are more likely to adopt play-based approaches to learning.

• Children are using teaching and learning materials more frequently in formal, private schools than in public schools.
Policy implications: Quality ECE for all

Provision

• **Invest in existing providers** as these already fill a gap in public provision and capacity is underutilised.

• **Explore the variation across ECE providers to address key policy questions:**
  • How can pre-primary school providers learn from each other?
  • Which model is the most cost-effective for government?
  • What does ‘good quality ECE’ mean for the government? For parents? For funders?

Access

• **Consider innovative financing mechanisms for parents** who cannot afford to pay as cost is main barrier.

Quality

• **Develop a framework for more consistent ECE-specific training** and invest in research on existing cost and quality of private training provision.